



4-5 July 2019

The EU, Russia, and the future of European Security

10th EUREN Meeting

Clingendael Netherlands Institute for International Relations

The European security order is in crisis. Its institutional structure has become fragile. Conflict and disagreements between Russia and the other European and Western states are undermining the capacity of major European security organisations, such as the OSCE and the Council of Europe, to take action. None of the sides has revoked the basic post-Cold War security treaties and arrangements, such as the Charter of Paris or the NATO-Russia Founding Act. However, their content and the principles they have enshrined for a common European peace and security order have become contentious.

Tensions have been building up at the regional level since the early 2000s. Violent conflict returned to Europe in 2008, and most profoundly in 2014. Broader military confrontation can no longer be ruled out entirely. At the same time, the transatlantic and international context of European security is also in flux. Crumbling international arms control regimes have further increased the risk of an arms build-up and confrontation in Europe. Information warfare, hybrid attacks and threats are contributing to the internal and transnational polarisation of societies, thereby undermining the very foundation of a peaceful European order.

Russia and the EU disagree on the root causes of the current crisis, as well as possible solutions. Many in Russia

feel that Western policy has not taken Russian security interests sufficiently into account over the past 30 years. On the contrary, Western actors, according to this view, have been aiming to establish a security order which excludes Russia. From this perspective, an improvement in relations requires an overhauled Euro-Atlantic security system that is based on the principle of the indivisibility of security. This also implies, at the very least, a reinterpretation of the existing legal documents (Helsinki 2 debate). In the EU, on the other hand, the Charter of Paris remains the foundation to preserve peace and stability in Europe, together with standards and values that are jointly shared in the CoE context. From this perspective, Russia's aggressive policy is the root cause of the crisis, including Russia's claim for a sphere of privileged interest in its neighbourhood. This especially holds true for Russian policies and actions vis-à-vis Ukraine since 2014, which led to a spiral of mutual sanctions that had been previously unthinkable. Therefore, a change in Russian policy is seen as being the key to improving the situation.

Against this background, the meeting will focus on three specific levels of European security: the institutional, the regional, and the societal. Discussions should analyse both EU and Russian perceptions and approaches to European security, establish the differences and explore overlaps which could serve as the basis for more constructive engagement in the future.

Thursday, 4 July 2019

Clingendael 7 , VH The Hague

14.30 - 15.00 Welcoming remarks

Tom DE BRUIJN, Clingendael Institute, The Hague

Markus EDERER, EU Ambassador to the Russian Federation, Moscow

Ivan TIMOFEEV, Russian International Affairs Council, Moscow

15.00 - 16.30 Opening Plenary: The EU, Russia, and European Security – Past, present and future

- What do Moscow and Brussels see as the main challenges to peace and security in Europe?
- Are "coloured revolutions" and "hybrid attacks" symptoms of a more profound systemic conflict or the root cause for the loss of trust?
- What are the EU's and Russia's main priorities regarding European Security? What solutions do they propose to the current challenges?
- Where are Russian and EU positions irreconcilable and where do they overlap? Is there space for cooperation, and if so, in which areas?

Speakers: **Alexander GUSAROV**, Department for European Cooperation, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation, Moscow

Thomas MAYR-HARTING, European External Action Service

Chair: **Sabine FISCHER**, Public Diplomacy. EU and Russia, Moscow/SWP, Berlin

17.30 - 19.00 Public Debate: The EU and Russia in an international rules-based order

Internationaal Perscentrum Nieuwspoort

Lange Poten 10

2511 CL Den Haag

Speakers: **Markus EDERER**, EU Ambassador to the Russian Federation, Moscow

Marieke DE HOON, Amsterdam Free University

Tatiana ROMANOVA, St. Petersburg State University

Mark ENTIN, MGIMO, Moscow

Chair: **Rem KORTEWEG**, Clingendael Institute, The Hague

Friday, 5 July 2019

Clingendael 7 , VH The Hague

09.00 - 11.00 Parallel Workshops

13.30 - 15.00 Concluding plenary: Conclusions from workshops
(plus concluding brainstorming)

15.00 End of meeting

Workshop 1: The institutional level

In the optimistic 1990s, existing European security institutions were developed further in order to build the foundation of the post-Cold War European security order. The CSCE transformed into the OSCE on the basis of the Charter of Paris for a New Europe. Most former Socialist and post-Soviet states joined the Council of Europe. The Russia-NATO Founding Act was concluded in 1996 as a basis for cooperation. The EU, EU Member States and Russia were all deeply involved in these processes. This included addressing the security aspects when develop-

ing their bilateral relationship. The post-Cold War European security order already started to show signs of wear in the 2000s. Events in Ukraine in 2014 finally plunged it into a deep crisis. While security threats continue to grow in Europe and beyond, the existing institutions have not regained their capacity to take action and new institutions have not emerged. Cracks in the transatlantic relationship and a new ice age in Russian-American relations have added to the volatility of this situation. The workshop will tackle the following questions:

- How do the EU and Russia perceive European security institutions today? How do they perceive their own role and policies within European security institutions/structures?
- Which institutions, in their own respective views, have the most potential to solve the current crisis? How can trust be rebuilt in times of hybrid threats?
- Where could Russia and the EU cooperate to mitigate the current crisis and strengthen European security institutions?
- What role does the US play in the European security order – and what role is it likely to play in the future?

Speakers:

Valery GARBUZOV, ISKRAN, Russia

Olga OLIKER, International Crisis Group, Brussels

Jana PUGLIERIN, The German Council on Foreign Relations, Berlin

Moderators:

Kadri LIIK, ECFR, Berlin

Larisa DERIGLASOVA, University of Tomsk

Workshop 2: The sub-regional level

Tensions have been building up in several regional theatres in Europe. The Baltic Sea region has seen an increase of military activity and the Black Sea region boasts several unresolved conflicts, including the war in Donbas. The Kerch incident in November 2018 demonstrated yet again the volatility of the situation

in this region. In contrast, the Arctic stands out as an area where geostrategic conflict has not (yet?) taken root. However, key actors have become more active there and it seems likely that tensions will rise in the future. The workshop will address the following questions:

- What are the perceptions and priorities of the EU and Russia regarding developments in the regional theatres under discussion?
- What steps should be taken to decrease tensions in the Baltics and the Black Sea region?
- What measures should be taken to prevent the Arctic region from turning into a new area of conflict?

Speakers:

Andrey ZAGORSKI, Primakov Institute for World Economy and International Relations RAN, Moscow

Kristi RAIK, ICDS, Tallinn

Tony VAN DER TOGT, Clingendael Institute, The Hague

Moderators:

Natalia VIAKHIREVA, Russian International Affairs Council, Moscow

Laure DELCOUR, Université Paris 3 - Sorbonne nouvelle

Workshop 3: The societal level

In this age of hybrid attacks, fake news, information and cyberwar, societies are subject to rapid polarisation, both internally and transnationally. This fundamentally affects political institutions, parties and the public's trust in election results and the media, particularly in Western democracies. Societies across Europe increasingly exist in separate and isolated information spaces and echo chambers. Perceptions are drifting

apart and narratives have become irreconcilable, thereby undermining the very idea of a common European space, including in the area of security. The shared ambition to conduct honest, facts-based debates and to search for compromise is increasingly being submerged by divisive and nationalistic narratives that are meant to please specific audiences. The workshop will focus on the following questions:

- How do the processes described above affect societies in Russia and the EU? How have they impacted on societal coherence over the past years? What role does the state (and within the EU, the EU itself) as well as state-society-relations play in this regard? What are the prospects for societal coherence in the short and medium term?
- How have relations between societies evolved in times of political crisis between the EU and Russia? What are the implications of their development for coherence, stability and peace in Europe?
- How can trust be (re)built and coherence be forged within and between societies across Europe?

Speakers

Ivan TIMOFEEV, RIAC, Moscow

Hanna SMITH, Hybrid CoE, Helsinki

Maria SHTEYNMAN, Higher School of Economics, Moscow

Moderators

Rem KORTEWEG, Clingendael Institute, The Hague

Nataliya MARKUSHINA, St. Petersburg State University

